January 14, 2000

Participant Service List D.T.E. 99-271

Mr. Raymond Sears, III Principal KPMG, LLP 1676 International Drive McLean, VA 22102

Mr. Robert F. Pilgrim Vice President Bell Atlantic 1095 Avenue of the Americas, Room 2549 New York, NY 10036

> Re: <u>Evaluation of Bell Atlantic-Massachusetts Operations Support Systems:</u> Final Attachment A to 11/19/99 Letter Order on Final Master Test Plan

Dear Messrs. Sears, Pilgrim and Participants:

On November 24, 1999, KPMG, LLP ("KPMG") submitted a final Master Test Plan ("MTP") pursuant to the Department of Telecommunications and Energy's ("Department") November 19, 1999 Letter Order. The Letter Order referenced a forthcoming "Attachment A" listing of performance standards or "metrics" and directed KMPG to examine and evaluate all of these standards as a part of its evaluation of Bell Atlantic-Massachusetts' ("Bell Atlantic") operations support systems ("OSS"). In the Letter Order, the Department announced its intention to establish a Performance Assurance Plan ("PAP"), consisting of the <u>Consolidated Arbitrations</u> metrics, Bell Atlantic's proposed supplements, and other metrics listed in Attachment A.

On December 7, 1999, Department staff released a draft Attachment A and requested comments on this draft from the participants to D.T.E. 99-271. The draft Attachment A incorporated all of the metrics adopted or modified by the New York Public Service Commission ("NYPSC") as a part of its ongoing Carrier-to-Carrier Performance Guidelines ("C2C Guidelines") collaborative process. On December 20, 1999, comments on the staff proposal were filed by Bell Atlantic, AT&T Communications of New England, Inc. ("AT&T"), and MCI WorldCom, Inc ("MCI"). Bell Atlantic supports the staff proposal. MCI and AT&T request the Department to supplement the draft Attachment A with additional metrics. This letter modifies the December 7, 1999 draft and finalizes the Department's Attachment A to the November 19, 1999 Letter Order.

The Federal Communications Commission ("FCC") recently found that "the scope of performance covered by the Carrier-to-Carrier metrics is sufficiently comprehensive . . . We disagree with commenters who suggest that additional metrics must be added to the plan in order to ensure its effectiveness . . . Moreover, we note that the [NYPSC] has indicated that it will consider adding new metrics, if necessary, in the future." Application by Bell Atlantic New York for Authorization Under Section 271 of the Communications Act to Provide In-Region InterLATA Service in the State of New York, CC Docket No. 99-295 at & 439 (rel. Dec. 22, 1999)(footnotes omitted). Accordingly, the Department incorporates here by reference the C2C Guidelines, as most recently modified by the NYPSC on November 5, 1999, as Attachment A. In addition, Attachment A will continue to be modified by all future additions, deletions or modifications made to the C2C Guidelines hereafter by the NYPSC.

In our November 19, 1999 Letter Order, we stated that the Massachusetts PAP will consist of the <u>Consolidated Arbitrations</u> metrics, Bell Atlantic's proposed supplements, and other metrics contained in Attachment A. It is clear, however, that the C2C Guidelines encompass much, if not all, of what is reported in the <u>Consolidated Arbitrations</u> metrics and in Bell Atlantic's proposed supplements. Therefore, the C2C Guidelines, as updated, will be the set of metrics used by the Department for purposes of the MTP and for evaluating Bell Atlantic's compliance with the requirements contained in § 271 of the Telecommunications Act of 1996. We will address separately how to establish remedies for any C2C metrics used in conjunction with, or as a replacement for, the <u>Consolidated Arbitrations</u> performance penalties.

In recognition of the substantial overlap between the C2C Guidelines and the measures included in Bell Atlantic's § 271 filing, the Department directs KPMG to examine and evaluate

refer to whatever system of penalties and remedies we will adopt.

In our November 19, 1999 Letter Order, we used the term APAP@ to refer to the list of metrics that will be reported. We note that in New York, the term is used to refer to the system of performance penalties, which apply only to a subset of the New York C2C metrics. From this point on, we will use the term APAP@ to

Bell Atlantic's performance based on the metrics contained in the C2C Guidelines that are in effect when the preorder, order and provisioning transaction testing begins, as well as a sample of the Department's <u>Consolidated Arbitrations</u> metrics. In accordance with the Letter Order, the scope of the KPMG test includes an investigation into the status of metrics "under development," and an appraisal of the relative capacity of Bell Atlantic to collect and report on such measures.

Consistent with previous KPMG requests, the Department directs Bell Atlantic to provide KPMG with the raw data, algorithms and calculated data for the past six months that KPMG deems necessary to evaluate Bell Atlantic's ability to collect and report on the Company's Massachusetts performance using NY C2C Guidelines algorithms and formatting. Also consistent with KPMG's previous requests, Bell Atlantic shall provide to KPMG whatever data KPMG seeks during its preorder, order and provisioning transaction testing in Massachusetts as well as all data KPMG requests after completion of its transaction testing. The Department also directs Bell Atlantic to provide the Department and all participants to D.T.E. 99-271 with the same six months of reports containing calculated data for Massachusetts, and to provide these reports indefinitely to the Department and D.T.E. 99-271 participants on a going-forward basis.

By Order of the Department
James Connelly, Commissioner
W. Robert Keating, Commissioner
Paul B. Vasington, Commissioner
Eugene J. Sullivan, Jr., Commissioner